HARVARD LAW REVIEW

Volume 126
2012–2013

Copyright © 2012, 2013
THE HARVARD LAW REVIEW ASSOCIATION
CAMBRIDGE, MASS.

Editorial Board

Justin M. Baker
Todd Beattie
Samuel C. Birnbaum
Joseph Borson
Nikolas Bowie
Thomas S. Burnett
Joe Busa
Adam Cambier
Gerard Justin Cedrone
Geng Chen
Maurene Comey
Felipe Corredor
Jonathan A. Cox
Bryce Daigle
William Dreher
Cormac Early
Zachary Eddington
Samantha T. Fang
David J. Feder
Ryan Galisewski
Brendan Gants
Kristin M. García
John Michael Geise
Josh Geller
Patrick Gibson
Adam L. Goodman
Charles P. Griffin
Leslie Griffith
Gillian Grossman
Ingrid Gustafson
Gregory L. Halperin
Caitlin Halpern
Samuel T. Harbourt
Laura C. Hill
Justin R. Horton
Nicholas Hunter
Lucas Issacharoff
Benjamin F. Jackson
Danielle E. Johnson
Brett M. Kalikow
Daniel R. Kanter
David Korn
Jeremy S. Kreisberg
Ashton R. Lattimore
Nathan Lovejoy
Anna Lvovsky
Daniel J. Marcet
Anthony W. Mariano
Alyssa P. Martin
Christopher Miles
Reena T. Mittelman
Conor Mulroe
Jason Neal
Michael D. Neff
Pascual Oliu
Bradley Oppenheimer
Jason Orr
Robin M. Peguero
Ashwin Phatak
Graham E. Phillips
Jason Z. Qu
Owen F. Roberts
Sean Roberts
Andrew Rohrbach
Alan Z. Rozenshtein
Andrew Cath Rubenstein
Abraham I. Rudy
Rachel Sachs
Ronni Sadovsky
Karissa J. Sauder
Jordan F. Sauer
Eden Schiffmann
Greg Schmidt
Corinne M. Smith
Dylan Stern
Al-Amyn Sumar
Vivek Suri
Conor Tochilin
Alex Triantaphyllis
Kenta Tsuda
Ivano Ventresca
Justin David Ward
Alexandra Wendell
Wesley L. White
Brooke J. Willig
Jordan Wish
Sunshine W. Yin
Olga I. Zverovich

Denis O'Brien
Circulation & Financial Director

Jennifer Heath
Editorial & IT Coordinator

Catherine Finnie
Staff Assistant

LEADING ARTICLES, COMMENTS, COMMENTARIES, AND ESSAYS — AUTHORS —

BIBAS, STEPHANOS. *Comment: Incompetent Plea Bargaining and Extrajudicial Reforms* 150

BRADLEY, CURTIS A., AND TREVOR W. MORRISON. *Historical Gloss and the Separation of Powers* 411

COHEN, JULIE E. *Symposium: What Privacy Is For* 1904

FENNELL, LEE ANNE. *The Problem of Resource Access* 1471

GREINER, D. JAMES, CASSANDRA WOLOS PATTANAYAK, AND JONATHAN HENNESSY. *The Limits of Unbundled Legal Assistance: A Randomized Study in a Massachusetts District Court and Prospects for the Future* 901

HUANG, BERT I. *Essay: Shallow Signals* 2227

KAPLOW, LOUIS. *Multistage Adjudication* 1179

KARLAN, PAMELA S. *Foreword: Democracy and Disdain* 1

LEMOS, MARGARET H. *Aggregate Litigation Goes Public: Representative Suits by State Attorneys General* 486

LEONG, NANCY. *Racial Capitalism* 2151

METZGER, GILLIAN E. *Comment: To Tax, To Spend, To Regulate* 83

MINOW, MARTHA. *Comment: Affordable Convergence: "Reasonable Interpretation" and the Affordable Care Act* 117

NOU, JENNIFER. *Agency Self-Insulation Under Presidential Review* 1755

RAVE, D. THEODORE. *Politicians as Fiduciaries* 671

RICHARDS, NEIL M. *Symposium: The Dangers of Surveillance* 1934

SCHWARTZ, PAUL M. *Symposium: The EU-U.S. Privacy Collision: A Turn to Institutions and Procedures* 1966

SOLOVE, DANIEL J. *Symposium: Introduction: Privacy Self-Management and the Consent Dilemma* 1880

STRAHILEVITZ, LIOR JACOB. *Symposium: Toward a Positive Theory of Privacy Law* 2010

SUNSTEIN, CASS R. *Commentary: The Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs: Myths and Realities* 1838

LEADING ARTICLES, COMMENTS, COMMENTARIES, AND ESSAYS — TITLES —

AGENCY SELF-INSULATION UNDER PRESIDENTIAL REVIEW. *Jennifer Nou* 1755

AGGREGATE LITIGATION GOES PUBLIC: REPRESENTATIVE SUITS BY STATE ATTORNEYS GENERAL. *Margaret H. Lemos* 486

COMMENT: AFFORDABLE CONVERGENCE: "REASONABLE INTERPRETATION" AND THE AFFORDABLE CARE ACT. *Martha Minow* 117

COMMENT: INCOMPETENT PLEA BARGAINING AND EXTRAJUDICIAL REFORMS. *Stephanos Bibas* 150

COMMENT: TO TAX, TO SPEND, TO REGULATE. *Gillian E. Metzger* 83

COMMENTARY: THE OFFICE OF INFORMATION AND REGULATORY AFFAIRS: MYTHS AND REALITIES. *Cass R. Sunstein* 1838

ESSAY: SHALLOW SIGNALS. *Bert I. Huang* 2227

FOREWORD: DEMOCRACY AND DISDAIN. *Pamela S. Karlan* 1

HISTORICAL GLOSS AND THE SEPARATION OF POWERS. *Curtis A. Bradley and Trevor W. Morrison* 411

THE LIMITS OF UNBUNDLED LEGAL ASSISTANCE: A RANDOMIZED STUDY IN A MASSACHUSETTS DISTRICT COURT AND PROSPECTS FOR THE FUTURE. *D. James Greiner, Cassandra Wolos Pattanayak, and Jonathan Hennessy* 901

MULTISTAGE ADJUDICATION. *Louis Kaplow* 1179

POLITICIANS AS FIDUCIARIES. *D. Theodore Rave* 671

THE PROBLEM OF RESOURCE ACCESS. *Lee Anne Fennell* 1471

RACIAL CAPITALISM. *Nancy Leong* 2151

SYMPOSIUM: THE DANGERS OF SURVEILLANCE. *Neil M. Richards* 1934

SYMPOSIUM: THE EU-U.S. PRIVACY COLLISION: A TURN TO INSTITUTIONS AND PROCEDURES. *Paul M. Schwartz* 1966

SYMPOSIUM: INTRODUCTION: PRIVACY SELF-MANAGEMENT AND THE CONSENT DILEMMA. *Daniel J. Solove* 1880

SYMPOSIUM: TOWARD A POSITIVE THEORY OF PRIVACY LAW. *Lior Jacob Strahilevitz* 2010

SYMPOSIUM: WHAT PRIVACY IS FOR. *Julie E. Cohen* 1904

BOOKS REVIEWED

ABRAMOFF: CAPITOL PUNISHMENT: THE HARD TRUTH ABOUT WASHINGTON CORRUPTION FROM AMERICA'S MOST NOTORIOUS LOBBYIST 550

AMAR: AMERICA'S UNWRITTEN CONSTITUTION: THE PRECEDENTS AND PRINCIPLES WE LIVE BY 1532

BIBAS: THE MACHINERY OF CRIMINAL JUSTICE 1299

GOLDSMITH: POWER AND CONSTRAINT: THE ACCOUNTABLE PRESIDENCY AFTER 9/11 990

HARTOG: SOMEDAY ALL THIS WILL BE YOURS: A HISTORY OF INHERITANCE AND OLD AGE 2289

LESSIG: REPUBLIC, LOST: HOW MONEY CORRUPTS POLITICS — AND A PLAN TO STOP IT 550

MACK: REPRESENTING THE RACE: THE CREATION OF THE CIVIL RIGHTS LAWYER 2312

MARTINEZ: THE SLAVE TRADE AND THE ORIGINS OF INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW 2043

MAZZONE: COPYFRAUD AND OTHER ABUSES OF INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY LAW 740

PATRY: HOW TO FIX COPYRIGHT 740

BOOK REVIEWS
— REVIEWERS —

ALSTON, PHILIP. *Does the Past Matter? On the Origins of Human Rights* 2043

DUBLER, ARIELA R. *All Unhappy Families: Tales of Old Age, Rational Actors, and the Disordered Life* 2289

GOLUBOFF, RISA. *Lawyers, Law, and the New Civil Rights History* 2312

HASEN, RICHARD L. *Fixing Washington* 550

KATYAL, NEAL KUMAR. *Stochastic Constraint* 990

LACEY, NICOLA. *Humanizing the Criminal Justice Machine: Re-Animated Justice or Frankenstein's Monster?* 1299

SAMUELSON, PAMELA. *Is Copyright Reform Possible?* 740

STRAUSS, DAVID A. *Not Unwritten, After All?* 1532

NOTES

The Benefits of Unequal Protection 1348
Counteracting the Bias: The Department of Labor's Unique Opportunity to Combat Human Trafficking 1012
Diagnostic Method Patents and Harms to Follow-On Innovation 1370
Enabling Television Competition in a Converged Market 2083
Ending Student Loan Exceptionalism: The Case for Risk-Based Pricing and Dischargeability 587
Importing a Trade or Business Limitation into § 2036: Toward a Regulatory Solution to FLP-Driven Transfer Tax Avoidance 1326
Indian Canon Originalism 1100
Juvenile *Miranda* Waiver and Parental Rights 2359
The Meaning(s) of "The People" in the Constitution 1078
Preemption as Purposivism's Last Refuge 1056
Proposing a Locally Driven Entrepreneur Visa 2403
The Province of the Jurist: Judicial Resistance to Expert Testimony on Eyewitnesses as Institutional Rivalry 2381
Recasting the U.S. International Trade Commission's Role in the Patent System 2337
The SEC Is Not an Independent Agency 781
Three Formulations of the Nexus Requirement in Reasonable Accommodations Law 1392
Tilling the Vast Wasteland: The Case for Reviving Localism in Public Interest Obligations for Cable Television 1034

DEVELOPMENTS IN THE LAW: IMMIGRANT RIGHTS & IMMIGRATION ENFORCEMENT

INTRODUCTION 1567
PLENARY POWER, DOMA, AND EXECUTIVE DEFERENCE 1583
REPRESENTATION IN REMOVAL PROCEEDINGS 1658
THE ROLE OF THE EXCLUSIONARY RULE IN REMOVAL HEARINGS 1633
STATE AND LOCAL REGULATION OF UNAUTHORIZED IMMIGRANT EMPLOYMENT 1608

RECENT CASES

Absolute Activist Value Master Fund Ltd. v. Ficeto, 677 F.3d 60 (2d Cir. 2012) 1430
AKM LLC v. Secretary of Labor, 675 F.3d 752 (D.C. Cir. 2012) 627
American Beverage Ass'n v. Snyder, 700 F.3d 796 (6th Cir. 2012) 2435
American Civil Liberties Union of Illinois v. Alvarez, 679 F.3d 583 (7th Cir. 2012), *cert. denied*, No. 12-318, 2012 WL 4050487 (U.S. Nov. 26, 2012) 1162
Arizona v. United States, 132 S. Ct. 2492 (2012) 327
Bancorp Services, L.L.C. v. Sun Life Assurance Co. of Canada (U.S.), 687 F.3d 1266 (Fed. Cir. 2012) 810
Bunch v. Smith, 685 F.3d 546 (6th Cir. 2012) 860
Christopher v. SmithKline Beecham Corp., 132 S. Ct. 2156 (2012) 357
Coalition for Responsible Regulation v. EPA, 684 F.3d 102 (D.C. Cir. 2012) 653
Coleman v. Court of Appeals of Maryland, 132 S. Ct. 1327 (2012) 317
Dominion Resources, Inc. v. United States, 681 F.3d 1313 (Fed. Cir. 2012) 1747
EEOC v. Boh Bros. Construction Co., 689 F.3d 458 (5th Cir. 2012) 1699
EME Homer City Generation, L.P. v. EPA, 696 F.3d 7 (D.C. Cir. 2012), *reh'g and reh'g en banc denied*, No. 11-1302 (D.C. Cir. Jan. 24, 2013) 1739
Flava Works, Inc. v. Gunter, 689 F.3d 754 (7th Cir. 2012) 2479
Florence v. Board of Chosen Freeholders, 132 S. Ct. 1510 (2012) 206
Floyd v. City of New York, 82 Fed. R. Serv. 3d (West) 833 (S.D.N.Y. 2012) 826
Golan v. Holder, 132 S. Ct. 873 (2012) 286
Grocery Manufacturers Ass'n v. EPA, 693 F.3d 169 (D.C. Cir. 2012), *reh'g en banc denied*, No. 10-1380 (D.C. Cir. Jan. 15, 2013) 1446
GSS Group Ltd. v. National Port Authority, 680 F.3d 805 (D.C. Cir. 2012) 1691
Hamdan v. United States, 696 F.3d 1238 (D.C. Cir. 2012) 1683
Headley v. Church of Scientology Int'l, 687 F.3d 1173 (9th Cir. 2012) 2121
Hettinga v. United States, 677 F.3d 471 (D.C. Cir. 2012) (per curiam), *reh'g en banc denied*, No. 11-5065 (D.C. Cir. June 21, 2012) 1146
Hosanna-Tabor Evangelical Lutheran Church & School v. EEOC, 132 S. Ct. 694 (2012) 176
Howes v. Fields, 132 S. Ct. 1181 (2012) 236
Case C-364/10, *Hungary v. Slovak Republic*, 2012 ECJ EUR-Lex LEXIS 2465 (Oct. 16, 2012) 2425
Intercollegiate Broadcasting System, Inc. v. Copyright Royalty Board, 684 F.3d 1332 (D.C. Cir. 2012), *reh'g and reh'g en banc denied*, No. 11-1083 (D.C. Cir. Aug. 28, 2012) 834
Knox v. Service Employees International Union, Local 1000, 132 S. Ct. 2277 (2012) 186
Lafler v. Cooper, 132 S. Ct. 1376 (2012) 150
Levin v. Madigan, 692 F.3d 607 (7th Cir. 2012) 1414
M.D. ex rel. Stukenberg v. Perry, 675 F.3d 832 (5th Cir. 2012) 1130
Macy v. Holder, No. 0120120821, 2012 WL 1435995 (E.E.O.C. Apr. 20, 2012) 1731
Martinez v. Ryan, 132 S. Ct. 1309 (2012) 337

Massachusetts v. United States Department of Health & Human Services, 682 F.3d 1 (1st Cir. 2012) 611
Mayo Collaborative Services v. Prometheus Laboratories, Inc., 132 S. Ct. 1289 (2012) 347
McFaul v. Valenzuela, 684 F.3d 564 (5th Cir. 2012) 1154
Messerschmidt v. Millender, 132 S. Ct. 1235 (2012) 216
Miller v. Alabama, 132 S. Ct. 2455 (2012) 276
Minneci v. Pollard, 132 S. Ct. 617 (2012) 296
Minnesota Citizens Concerned for Life, Inc. v. Swanson, 692 F.3d 864 (8th Cir. 2012) (en banc) 1715
Missouri v. Frye, 132 S. Ct. 1399 (2012) 150
Moore v. Madigan, 702 F.3d 933 (7th Cir. 2012), *reh'g en banc denied*, 708 F.3d 901 (7th Cir. 2013) 2461
Morvant v. P.F. Chang's China Bistro, Inc., No. 11-CV-05405 YGR, 2012 WL 1604851 (N.D. Cal. May 7, 2012) 1122
National Federation of Independent Business v. Sebelius, 132 S. Ct. 2566 (2012) 72
People v. Lopez, 286 P.3d 469 (Cal. 2012), *cert. denied*, 133 S. Ct. 1501 (2013) 2453
Perry v. New Hampshire, 132 S. Ct. 716 (2012) 246
Perry v. Perez, 132 S. Ct. 934 (2012) 377
Planned Parenthood Minnesota, North Dakota, South Dakota v. Rounds, 686 F.3d 889 (8th Cir. 2012) (en banc) 1438
R.J. Reynolds Tobacco Co. v. Food & Drug Administration, 696 F.3d 1205 (D.C. Cir. 2012) 818
Smentek v. Dart, 683 F.3d 373 (7th Cir. 2012) 2443
Southern Union Co. v. United States, 132 S. Ct. 2344 (2012) 256
Spirit Airlines, Inc. v. U.S. Department of Transportation, 687 F.3d 403 (D.C. Cir. 2012) 1422
Stankewitz v. Wong, 698 F.3d 1163 (9th Cir. 2012) 2139
Terenkian v. Republic of Iraq, 694 F.3d 1122 (9th Cir. 2012) 1170
Underwood v. Harkins, 698 F.3d 1335 (11th Cir. 2012) 2131
United States v. Alvarez, 132 S. Ct. 2537 (2012) 196
United States v. Chappell, 691 F.3d 388 (4th Cir. 2012) 842
United States v. Danielczyk, 683 F.3d 611 (4th Cir. 2012), *cert. denied*, No. 12-579, 2013 WL 656067 (U.S. Feb. 25, 2013) 1707
United States v. Davis, 690 F.3d 226 (4th Cir. 2012) 637
United States v. Dinkins, 691 F.3d 358 (4th Cir. 2012), *cert. denied*, No. 12-7923, 2013 WL 598772 (U.S. Feb. 19, 2013) 1723
United States v. Dire, 680 F.3d 446 (4th Cir. 2012) 619
United States v. Hamilton, 699 F.3d 356 (4th Cir. 2012) 2113
United States v. Home Concrete & Supply, LLC, 132 S. Ct. 1836 (2012) 367
United States v. Jeffries, 692 F.3d 473 (6th Cir. 2012) 1138
United States v. Jones, 132 S. Ct. 945 (2012) 226
United States v. Laraneta, 700 F.3d 983 (7th Cir. 2012), *reh'g en banc denied*, No. 12-1302 (7th Cir. Feb. 1, 2013) 2471
United States v. Nosal, 676 F.3d 854 (9th Cir. 2012) (en banc) 1454

United States v. Skinner, 690 F.3d 772 (6th Cir. 2012), *reh'g and reh'g en banc denied*, No. 09-6497 (6th Cir. Sept. 26, 2012) 802
Viacom International, Inc. v. YouTube, Inc., 676 F.3d 19 (2d Cir. 2012) 645
Williams v. Illinois, 132 S. Ct. 2221 (2012) 266
Wilson v. Flaherty, 689 F.3d 332 (4th Cir. 2012) 2105
Yonaty v. Mincolla, 945 N.Y.S.2d 774 (App. Div. 2012) 852
Zivotofsky ex rel. Zivotofsky v. Clinton, 132 S. Ct. 1421 (2012) 307

RECENT REGULATION

Health Insurance Premium Tax Credit, 77 Fed. Reg. 30,377 (May 23, 2012) (to be codified at 26 C.F.R. pt. 1) 663

RECENT BOOK

Review of Martha C. Nussbaum and Alison LaCroix,
Subversion and Sympathy: Gender, Law, and the British Novel 1462